

Commission on the Prevention of Violence Against Women-Grand Jury Response

Lisa Murphy <LMurphy@santacruzca.gov> Mon, Sep 9, 2024 at 9:47 AM To: "katherine.Hansen@santacruzcourt.org" <katherine.Hansen@santacruzcourt.org>, "grandjury@scgrandjury.org" <grandjury@scgrandjury.org> Cc: Gina Liebig <gliebig@santacruzca.gov>, danielle long <daniella.long@sbcglobal.net>

Good Morning,

The City of Santa Cruz Commission on the Prevention of Violence Against Women is pleased to submit their response to 2023-2024 Santa Cruz County Civil Grand Jury's report entitled "City of Santa Cruz: Preventing Rape and Domestic Violence, Where's The Priority?"

Included in this email is a copy of the Commissions Action Minutes approving the response from the Commission. The minutes will not be final until the Commissions meeting scheduled for November 6, 2024.



2 attachments

CPVAW_Grand Jury Response_CPVAW Invited Response Request 09-04-24 Revision by CPVAW_FINAL.pdf 219K

O9-04-24 CPVAW Action Summary.pdf
 62K

ACTION SUMMARY

City of Santa Cruz 809 Center Street Santa Cruz, California 95060

COMMISSION FOR THE PREVENTION OF VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN (CPVAW) REGULAR MEETING

September 4, 2024 Action Summary prepared on September 6, 2024

6:30 PM

Call to Order - at 6:30 p.m.

Roll Call - Commissioners Barrett, Feinman, Novak, Simonton, Trigueiro; Vice Chair Madura.

Commissioners Absent: Chair Long (Chair Long arrived at the meeting for Item 4)

Statements of Disqualifications - None.

Oral Communications - Vice Chair Madura opened the public comment period at 6:31 p.m. Vice Chair Madura closed the public comment period at 6:43 p.m.

Announcements - Staff member L. Murphy made announcements about a new stipend program and changes to terms of commissions.

Consent Agenda

1. <u>Minutes of the August 7, 2024 Commission for the Prevention of Violence</u> <u>Against Women Meeting</u>

Motion carried to approve as amended.

Presentations - None.

General Business

2. <u>Santa Cruz Police Department Update</u>

The Commission received the report and provided direction on the Santa Cruz Police Department (SCPD) monthly statistical rape and domestic violence

SEPTEMBER 4, 2024 COMMISSION FOR THE PREVENTION OF VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN ACTION SUMMARY 2

report.

3. <u>Santa Cruz County Civil Grand Jury Response (Continued from 8/7/24)</u>

Motion carried to authorize the Chairperson to submit responses to the Santa Cruz Civil Grand Jury on behalf of the CPVAW for the "City of Santa Cruz: Preventing Rape & Domestic Violence: Where's the Priority?" report with the following edits:

- a) Section F1, leave the statement: "Given the complexities of sorting rape data" and add a statement under programming to include "a half hour program being used by county schools to start difficult conversations on male rape."
- b) Section F2, paragraph one, change "may be" to "is" and fix typo "rate" to "rape" and paragraph two, change "FBI NIBR" to "FBI NIBRS."
- c) Section F8, remove everything from "SCPD response..." to the end of that section and fix typo "Ordinance" to "Ordinance's."
- 4. Ad-Hoc Committee Appointments & Fund Allocation (Continued from 8/7/24)

Motion carried to form ad-hoc committees for upcoming FY25 projects and to allocate funding in November as discussed.

5. Funding for to Support Shared Data Page (Continued from 08/07/2024)

Motion carried to approve funding in the amount of \$5,600 for the Coalition Facilitator and \$500 Annually for Website Development and Hosting for a Shared Data Page.

Information Items

6. FY25 CPVAW Work Plan

Update on street banners, will work with publicity committee to implement for October domestic violence month, reminder about work plan, event called "Stronger Together" on September 22nd at Aptos High School.

Reports from Ad Hoc and Standing Committees

Police Subcommittee - no update Publicity Ad-Hoc Committee - gave a brief update on social media Event Ad-Hoc Committee - Monarch event on October 10th.

Items Initiated by Members for Future Agendas

Santa Cruz City Schools - Vector Solutions (Nov) FY26 Budget (Nov) CPVAW Annual Report (Feb 26) Annual SCPD Training Report (Feb 26)

SEPTEMBER 4, 2024 COMMISSION FOR THE PREVENTION OF VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN ACTION SUMMARY

Election of Officers (Feb)

Adjournment - At 8:40 p.m., motion carried to adjourn.



The 2023–2024 Santa Cruz County Civil Grand Jury Invites the

Commission for the Prevention of Violence Against Women

to Respond by September 25, 2024

to the Findings and Recommendations listed below which were assigned to them in the report titled

City Of Santa Cruz: Preventing Rape and Domestic Violence

Where's The Priority?

Responses are **invited** from appointed agency and department heads, appointed committees, and non-profit agencies contracted to the county which are investigated by the Grand Jury. You are not required to respond by the California Penal Code (PC) §933(c).

If you choose to respond, please follow the instructions below when preparing your response.

Instructions for Respondents

Your assigned <u>Findings</u> and <u>Recommendations</u> are listed on the following pages with check boxes and an expandable space for summaries, timeframes, and explanations. Please follow these instructions, which paraphrase <u>PC 933.05</u>:

- 1. For the Findings, mark one of the following responses with an "X" and provide the required additional information:
 - a. AGREE with the Finding, or
 - b. **PARTIALLY DISAGREE with the Finding** specify the portion of the Finding that is disputed and include an explanation of the reasons why, or
 - c. **DISAGREE with the Finding** provide an explanation of the reasons why.
- 2. For the Recommendations, mark one of the following actions with an "X" and provide the required additional information:
 - a. HAS BEEN IMPLEMENTED provide a summary of the action taken, or
 - b. HAS NOT YET BEEN IMPLEMENTED BUT WILL BE IN THE FUTURE provide a timeframe or expected date for completion, or
 - c. **REQUIRES FURTHER ANALYSIS** provide an explanation, scope, and parameters of an analysis to be completed within six months, or
 - d. **WILL NOT BE IMPLEMENTED** provide an explanation of why it is not warranted or not reasonable.
- 3. Please confirm the date on which you approved the assigned responses:

We approved these responses in a regular public meeting as shown

in our minutes dated Sept 4, 2024

4. When your responses are complete, please email your completed Response Request as a PDF file attachment to both

The Honorable Katherine Hansen, Grand Jury Supervising Judge Katherine.Hansen@santacruzcourt.org and

The Santa Cruz County Grand Jury grandjury@scgrandjury.org.

If you have questions about this request form, please contact the Grand Jury by calling 831-454-2099 or by sending an email to <u>grandjury@scgrandjury.org</u>.

Findings

F1. Since 2016, the lack of comprehensive Annual Reports with detailed metrics on rape, including the tracking of stranger rape, leaves the community less informed, more vulnerable, and less safe.

___ AGREE

___X PARTIALLY DISAGREE

DISAGREE

Response explanation (required for a response other than **Agree**):

The Commission partially agrees with the assertion that the community is "less informed" due to the Annual Report lacking detailed metrics on known and stranger rape. The Commission disagrees that the lack of detailed metrics leaves the community more vulnerable and less safe as a result, due to the fact that there are no known data on what kinds of reporting create community safety, per se. We want the Annual report to consistently include both current and historical data on rape and domestic violence and anticipate being able to reach this goal with the support of our new part time staff. Ordinance No. 81-29, Section 5. (d), requires the Commission to "...submit annually, and the City Council review and act upon a report documenting, in detail, City, community, and police efforts to carry out the purposes of this ordinance." The Annual Reports historically included more detailed metrics on Rape and Domestic Violence. While we concur that no reports were prepared during the 2017-2019 years, the 2023 Report provided a full recovery of the available data for those years The 2023 Report includes data from FBI Uniform Crime Report for Rape and data from 2010-2023 on the following California Penal Code Sections relating to Rape: 220 Attempted Rape; 261/262 Rape; 286 Sodomy; 387/288 Oral Copulation and 289 Penetration with a foreign object. Additionally, the 2023 report also includes domestic violence statistics from 2015 to 2023

The Commission partially agrees with the Grand Jury's claim that a lack of detailed metrics leaves the community more vulnerable and less safe. FBI Uniformed Crime Report shows a 26% reduction in rape from 2022 to 2023, along with a 34% decrease in Domestic Violence cases by from 2020 to 2021 and a decline of 14% between 2022 and 2023. Due to reporting timeline issues, a recent seeming uptick in rape numbers for 2024 is likewise not the full picture until we see the aggregate for the year. In its efforts to determine a more informative set of metrics for assessing community risk types for reporting, the Commission voted in November 2023 to accept a revised reporting format for rape and domestic violence statistics to include all FBI UCR Data, and various California Penal Code Sections on Rape and Domestic Violence. If the Commission chooses to reassess the metrics requested from SCPD, including stranger rape data, the SCPD has indicated it is prepared to provide that information. The Commission is still gathering information to determine what metrics are most informative to its work in relation to prevention and education. Understanding how SCPD reports NIBRS/CIBRS is a work in progress.

Given the complexities of sorting rape data, The Commission continues to focus on enhanced outreach to the community by collaborating with other Community Based Organizations to raise awareness about prevention and available services for survivors. This includes co-sponsoring with Monarch Services the "Stronger Together" Fun Run/5K Race in September 2023 & 2024, partnering for the past two years in both the Dyke and Pride Parades, the 2024 March to End Homelessness, and the She is Beautiful race. The production of a 30-minute film, "How to start difficult conversations on rape" which is being shown in local schools. Additionally, the Commission partnered with Monarch Services and approved allocation of \$6,000 to support their efforts to end domestic violence and to provide assistance to all survivors of sexual assault.

- **F2.** By highlighting a generic national statistic on stranger rape, rather than assessing local metrics in the CPVAW 2023 Report, the City is minimizing stranger rape and misleading the public into a possible false sense of security.
 - ___ AGREE
- _x_ PARTIALLY DISAGREE
- __ DISAGREE

Response explanation (required for a response other than **Agree**):

The Commission partially disagrees with the assertion that presented data leads to a false sense of security. The CPVAW 2023 Annual Report includes, as approved by the Commission on November 1, 2023, data from the US Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Investigations, Uniform Crime Report on Rape which is data specific to the City of Santa Cruz. The Annual Report also includes specific data on 5 penal code categories of Sexual Assault violations which together reveal accurate rape statistics of crimes committed in the City of Santa Cruz. It is correct that this data does not distinguish between a stranger and an acquaintance. While this type of distinction is useful, there is no data supporting that this is misleading the public into a false sense of security. However, we do agree that publishing stranger rape alerts to our community would increase capacity for safety. The data cited in the Annual Report is from a nationally recognized association; Rape, Abuse, Incest National Network (RAINN) and is consistent with previous data analysis as reported in the 2005-07 Annual Report.

The data showed that the City was safer in 2023 than in previous years. The Uniform Crime Report showed a decrease in rape by 26% from 2022 to 2023, and a decrease in Domestic Violence cases by 34% from 2020 to 2021 and a decrease of 14% between 2022 and 2023. We may be well served to adopt the FBI NIBRS data as the county and the City of Scotts Valley utilize and publish these data. This merits a further discussion with SCPD.

Again, the Commission is reviewing its effective range of data for evaluation and appreciates SCPD cooperation in providing such data as is determined to be most informative to our efforts to realize the intent of the Ordinance.

- **F3.** The lack of attention to long-time Commission programs such as the Safe Place Network and the Bar Coaster program leaves residents and visitors without important resources for their personal safety.
- ___ AGREE
 - _ PARTIALLY DISAGREE
- _X_ DISAGREE

Response explanation (required for a response other than **Agree**):

The Commission is currently (see budget FY 24 and 25) leveraging their funds to partner with community-based organizations who specialize in providing victims of domestic violence and rape with much needed financial support to continue their successful programs and services. These organizations provide tangible resources that the Commission could not provide nor have the expertise to provide. In 2024 the Commission provided the following sponsorships to support local non-profit organizations: \$2,000 Walnut Ave Women's Center, a non-profit organization based in Santa Cruz that provides direct services to survivors of domestic violence including prevention and education and \$6,000 to Monarch Services, another local non-profit that offers immediate crisis response to survivors of domestic violence, sexual assault and human trafficking.

The Commission supported new programs to promote personal safety. For example, the Commission created PSAs aired on local channels to promote local safety; in 2023 the Commission partnered with the Santa Cruz City School district to provide high school students with an on-line course through Vector Solutions. This program offered targeted courses for grades 6-8 and 9-12, which would reach approximately 2,000 students. This mandatory program would enable the school to extend its reach, empowering more students to make informed choices, resist peer pressure, and foster health relationships. Topics included: Dealing with Stress and Anxiety; Self-Harm Awareness and Resolving Disagreements. Additional content included Mental Health and Wellbeing, Healthy Relationships & Inclusion, Personal & Community Safety and Student Safety and Wellness. The Commission funds self-defense programming each year. The City is the only local agency to have a Victim Advocate on staff in the Police Department. This important resource provides victims with information pamphlets outlining their rights, needed resources and advocate support through the legal system; and makes referrals to local agencies. The Advocate works with survivors to ensure they are treated with fairness and respect.

With regards to the Bar Coaster Program, the Commission has continued this program in FY 23 and 24. It is budgeted again in FY25. As of July 1^{st,} State Law requires all bars that do not provide food to provide drug testing kits to customers. The Commission supports this new law. In June of 2024 the Commission purchased an additional 500 drug testing coasters to distribute to bars located in the City of Santa Cruz. These have been distributed into the community and we would welcome the opportunity do more, as our budget is allocated for it.

The Commission had a program entitled Safe Place Network which is no longer active. The program began over 25 years ago by providing a window sticker to businesses stating they were a "Safe Place", however there was very little to no training provided for businesses and their staff. The program also lacked a comprehensive marketing and outreach plan to inform visitors and the community of its existence. There are no metrics or data to substantiate the claim that not having this program has left residents and visitors without important resources for their personal safety. However, the Commission could consider re-establishing the program if they should choose to do so in the future.

Of further note, the Commission requested and was awarded for FY 25 a half time staff person dedicated to Commission business. This will greatly enhance our efficacy in general and with sustaining event and distribution protocols, budget management, program development and implementation, and is a strong indicator of City Council recognition of the critical work the Commission produces for community safety. Getting resources out to the community requires coordination and support from staffing. We anticipate great improvement.

F8. The inconsistencies the Grand Jury found in SCPD's rape numbers means the public, the CPVAW and the City have no accurate metrics about reported rape, leaving the community ill-informed and Annual Commission Reports unreliable.

_ AGREE

x PARTIALLY DISAGREE DISAGREE

Response explanation (required for a response other than Agree):

City of Santa Cruz Ordinance No. 81-29 establishes specific responsibilities and cooperation between SCPD and CPVAW:

- Section 5(e): The Commission for the Prevention of Violence Against Women, in carrying out its duties shall have the authority to call upon members of the Police Department to present information which is not defined as confidential by State law. The Santa Cruz Police Department shall offer full and open cooperation to the Commission.
- Section 6(b): The Police Department shall create a separate statistical report form to document and consolidate all domestic violence and women beating calls. This shall be compiled monthly.

We are working with the SCPD to meet these requirements, and to access more accurate metrics and data to deliver to the community. Before the February 7, 2024, CPVAW meeting, where the SCPD's statistical report (Appendix A – Figure 8 Full Table) was first presented, the SCPD had been producing a simplified statistical monthly report. This report included data on domestic violence calls, domestic violence cases, rape cases, sexual assaults, stalking cases, and intimate partner homicide cases.

At the November 1, 2023, CPVAW meeting, the Commission approved a metrics change and sodomy and forcible sexual penetration with a foreign object, and forced oral copulation were separated from the generalized rape column, and assault to commit rape was added. In the following two meetings (February 1, 2024, and May 1, 2024), SCPD complied and continued to make improvements to provide an accurate and comprehensive statistical report. Improvements included updating all the monthly summary values to reflect the addition of any cold cases when they occurred, not when reported, and footnotes were added to provide clarifying language. This was to try and explain why the old numbers had changed from previous reports.

CPVAW continues to develop our understanding of the available and appropriate metrics to support the work from the Ordinance mandate. We want to be collaborative with the SCPD and our community partners as well as the community in general to advocate for the best possible shared information and responses.

Recommendations

- **R4.** The Grand Jury recommends that the SCPD update its website to include the detailed metrics on Rape Incidents submitted to NIBRS and CIBRS, ensuring all data entries are accurate and available at each meeting of the CPVAW, and have this in place by January 31, 2025. (F8, F9)
- ____ HAS BEEN IMPLEMENTED summarize what has been done
- HAS NOT YET BEEN IMPLEMENTED BUT WILL BE IN THE FUTURE summarize what will be done and the timeframe
- **REQUIRES FURTHER ANALYSIS** explain the scope and timeframe (not to exceed six months)

WILL NOT BE IMPLEMENTED – explain why

Required response explanation, summary, and timeframe:

The Commission understands, and the SCPD webpage via the City of Santa Cruz portal, that the UCR reporting system is phased out and the CIBRS/NIBRS metrics and data collection are being implemented. We look forward to working with SCPD to align our understanding and reporting of data as of 2024 in the new systems.

- **R6.** The Grand Jury recommends that the Commission and the SCPD submit comprehensive annual reports as called for in Ordinance 81-29, using the 2005-07 reports as a model, with the 2024 Annual Report placed on the Commission's agenda by December 31, 2024, and future reports submitted on a consistent, annual basis. (F1)
- ____ HAS BEEN IMPLEMENTED summarize what has been done
- REQUIRES FURTHER ANALYSIS explain the scope and timeframe (not to exceed six months)
- X____ WILL NOT BE IMPLEMENTED explain why

Required response explanation, summary, and timeframe:

The Annual Report as required by Ordinance No. 81-29, Section 5.(d), requires the Commission to "...submit annually, and the City Council review and act upon a report documenting, in detail, City, community, and police efforts to carry out the purposes of this ordinance." The Ordinance does not require the Annual Report to provide detailed metrics on Rape. However, various Annual Reports over the years have included more detailed metrics and data on Rape and Domestic Violence, including the most recent Annual Report for 2023. The 2023 Report includes aggregate numbers from the FBI Uniform Crime Report for Rape and Domestic Violence from 2015-2016 and 2021 - 2023, and data from 2010-2023 utilizing California's Rape Law definition. The Commission will continue to provide comprehensive reports as required by the Ordinance, including enhanced reporting with qualified metrics and data

The 2023 Annual Report is modeled after both the 2005-2007 and the 2008-2010 Annual Report. Both of those reports were co-authored by the Commission and the Santa Cruz Police Department. The earlier joint reports contained data on sexual assault including incidents by Penal Code Violations. However, the previous reports did not contain information on Domestic Violence, which the 2023 report contains. The previous reports include an analysis of demographics within each rape case, which has not been conducted since 2017. The Commission must decide the metrics and data that will serve the mandate of the Commission.

To be meaningful, the Annual Report must include a full years' worth of data. In order to provide the community with a comprehensive Annual Report, the CPVAW Annual Report will be presented at the February meeting of the following calendar year.

- **R7.** The Grand Jury recommends that the 2023 Report be amended to remove the national entry on stranger rape, replacing it with accurate data for the City of Santa Cruz by December 31, 2024. (F2)
- HAS BEEN IMPLEMENTED summarize what has been done
 HAS NOT YET BEEN IMPLEMENTED BUT WILL BE IN THE FUTURE summarize what will be done and the timeframe
 REQUIRES FURTHER ANALYSIS explain the scope and timeframe (not to exceed six months)
- ____ WILL NOT BE IMPLEMENTED explain why

Required response explanation, summary, and timeframe:

The Commission appreciates SCPD's continued support in the collection of appropriate metrics and data that are useful towards the prevention and education mission. The Commission shares the perspective with SCPD that both national statistics on stranger rape and local metrics are important to provide the public with a wide and deep perspective. The data SCPD has presented is accurate in part; however more work is needed to resolve inconsistencies due to the different methodologies of UCR data, NIBRS/CIBRS. We look forward to collectively refining this work.